

COMPARING THE EFFECTIVENESS OF HUMAN AND AI GENERATED ENDORSERS IN ADVERTISING CAMPAIGNS

Deni Adha Akbari^{1*}, Ujang Sumarwan², Nur Hasanah³, Rizki Edmi Edison⁴

¹Faculty of Economics and Business - Universitas Muhammadiyah Prof. Dr. Hamka, Jakarta, Indonesia.

^{2,3}School of Business - IPB University, Bogor, Indonesia.

⁴Neuroscience Institute - Universitas Prima Indonesia, Medan, Indonesia.

⁴Institute of Leadership, Innovation, and Advancement - Universiti Brunei Darussalam, Bandar Seri Begawan, Brunei Darussalam.

⁴Research Center of Public Policy - National Research and Innovation Agency, Jakarta, Indonesia.

*Corresponding Author: deni@uhamka.ac.id

Article Info: Received: August 3, 2023; Revised: Sept 25, 2023; Accepted: Sept 28, 2023

Abstract: This review explores the contrasting roles of machine-driven and human endorsers in advertising campaigns, assessing their ability to engage consumer visual attention. With its ability to tailor content and predict consumer responses, the machine-driven approach has brought new dimensions to advertising, though its influence may differ across various demographic groups. Conversely, human endorsers substantially impact consumer decisions because they can form emotional bonds, enhance authenticity, and build trust. The review encourages a perspective that sees machine-driven and human endorsers not as rivals but as complementary forces, with further studies needed to investigate how to combine these elements best.

Keywords: Artificial Intelligence-Endorser, Human Endorsers, Consumer Behaviour

Abstrak: Tinjauan ini mengeksplorasi peran kontras antara endorser yang digerakkan mesin dan manusia dalam kampanye periklanan, menilai kemampuan mereka untuk menarik perhatian visual konsumen. Pendekatan yang digerakkan mesin, dengan kemampuannya untuk menyesuaikan konten dan memprediksi respons konsumen, telah membawa dimensi baru ke periklanan, meskipun pengaruhnya mungkin berbeda di berbagai kelompok demografis. Sebaliknya, endorser manusia berdampak besar pada keputusan konsumen, berkat kapasitas mereka untuk membentuk ikatan emosional, meningkatkan keaslian, dan membangun kepercayaan. Tinjauan ini mendorong perspektif yang melihat endorser yang digerakkan mesin dan manusia bukan sebagai saingan tetapi sebagai kekuatan yang saling melengkapi, dengan

studi lebih lanjut diperlukan untuk menyelidiki bagaimana cara terbaik menggabungkan elemen-elemen ini.

Kata Kunci: Endorser Kecerdasan Buatan, Endorser Manusia, Perilaku Konsumen

INTRODUCTION

Endorsers, created by human intelligence or Artificial Intelligence (AI), play a vital role in forming consumer opinions and swaying purchasing choices (Albarq et al., 2022). The measure of an endorser's effectiveness often lies in the ability to capture and sustain consumer interest, a critical element in the triumph of an advertising initiative (Pelau et al., 2022). The emergence of AI endorsers has introduced a fresh aspect to this equation. Created through complex machine learning processes, AI endorsers present a combination of uniformity, expandability, and customization that is challenging to replicate with human endorsers (Mishra & Tyagi, 2022). These AI-generated influencers, utilizing AI technologies, engage with and persuade potential customers in a manner akin to human celebrities, yielding favorable brand outcomes (Thomas & Fowler, 2021). Research in the Journal of Advertising has revealed that, much like human influencers, AI influencers can engage in actions that may tarnish the brand's reputation. However, an exciting distinction arises in consumer perception. Consumers tend to generalize the actions of AI influencers, viewing a misstep by one as indicative of all AI influencers, whereas human influencers are seen as individual entities (Lou et al., 2022). This nuanced difference in perception underscores the complexity of integrating AI endorsers into marketing strategies and highlights the need to consider their unique characteristics and potential impact carefully.

This research focuses on exploring the burgeoning field of virtual influencers, comparing their roles and effectiveness with those of human influencers. The goal is to offer an exhaustive insight into the present landscape of AI endorsement and its possible ramifications for marketing's future (Armando et al., 2022). Utilizing a systematic review methodology, the study will scrutinize existing literature to understand various facets of virtual influencers comprehensively. These facets encompass their development, function in marketing, and influence on consumer conduct. The conclusions drawn from this research will add to the expanding corpus of knowledge on AI endorsement, furnishing essential insights for marketers and enterprises interested in capitalizing on this innovative form of influencer marketing (Chen

et al., 2022). The research will probe the influence of self-congruity on consumer reactions to virtual influencers. The concept of self-congruity suggests that people tend to engage more with those who reflect their values and beliefs (Greenberg et al., 2021). By applying this theory to virtual influencers, the study aims to ascertain whether consumers are more inclined to connect with virtual influencers that resonate with their values.

METHOD

This literature review employs a systematic process to gather extensive and pertinent information. The method involves a thorough search protocol to encompass diverse viewpoints on the impact of artificial intelligence and human endorsers within advertising initiatives. The search protocol involves several databases: ScienceDirect, IEEE Xplore, JSTOR, Google Scholar, and EBSCOhost. The search leverages keywords and phrases such as "artificial intelligence," "AI endorser," "virtual endorser," "human endorsers," "celebrity endorsement," "consumer behavior," and "visual attention" Refinement of the search uses Boolean operators "AND" and "OR." The review includes articles that extensively discuss the influence of AI and human endorsers on consumer behavior in advertising campaigns, focusing on visual attention. The time frame for the studies under consideration spans from 2010 to 2023.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

AI has been increasingly utilized in various fields, including marketing, revolutionizing traditional practices. Artificial intelligence finds utilization in marketing initiatives, providing multiple applications that amplify the success of these campaigns. Specific applications of artificial intelligence in this domain include its role in ad placement. For instance, artificial intelligence can manage functions like digital ad positioning, commonly called "programmatic buying." This process leverages artificial intelligence to determine the optimal locations and timings for ad placements to achieve maximum effect (Chen et al., 2022). Second, generative AI video tools can create high-quality marketing and product demo videos. By generating engaging and visually appealing content, these tools can increase brand awareness and facilitate conversions (Hye, 2023). Third, in Marketing Automation, AI can automate various aspects of marketing, freeing up time for marketers to focus on creating new campaigns. This can include automating routine tasks and using machine learning to improve marketing strategies (Boddu

et al., 2022). Fourth, Personalization and Optimization: AI can gather insights into customers to produce better, more personalized content. Marketing assets guided by AI are optimized for the customer journey, including targeted advertising and content generation (Haleem et al., 2022). Fifth, Customer Segmentation and Messaging: AI can segment and message customers optimally. It can also work to automate these processes to save businesses time and money and fine-tune marketing strategies (Haleem et al., 2022).



Fig. 1. Several AI-Utilized in Marketing Campaigns.

A systematic literature review revealed several noteworthy findings on artificial intelligence and human influence in advertising campaigns and how each impacts visual attention. These results reflect the synthesis and analysis of data extracted from various relevant studies. Research shows that artificial intelligence significantly enhances the customization and personalization of online shopping experiences (Nwachukwu & Affen, 2023). Algorithms analyze past consumer behaviors and preferences, allowing AI to generate personalized product suggestions and advertisements (Campbell et al., 2020). Studies demonstrate that AI-generated endorsements and advertisements garner considerable attention due to their tailored nature (Campbell et al., 2020).

Furthermore, AI applications such as chatbots and virtual assistants contribute to efficient and enhanced customer interactions, improving the advertising campaign experience (Nguyen, 2023). These innovations have increasingly become vital to advertising campaign platforms, influencing customer decisions and garnering visual attention. In advertising campaigns, using artificial intelligence, especially in tailoring advertisements and improving user engagement, has led to favorable results (Carrion et al., 2023; Owusu Asante et al., 2023). These studies concur that customization is a crucial factor in the behavior of online consumers. Algorithms based on artificial intelligence attend to individual tastes and patterns, enhancing the efficiency and satisfaction of online shopping experiences (Rathore, 2023; Yin & Qiu, 2021). However, it's worth recognizing that the influence of artificial intelligence may differ among various demographic groups and settings, indicating a need for additional investigation to grasp its capabilities thoroughly.

The research conducted by Franke et al., (2023) delved into the novel concept of virtual influencers acting as celebrity endorsers. This study revealed that, despite being non-human, virtual influencers have the potential to endorse products effectively and shape consumer behavior. Similarly, the findings from Lou et al., (2022) added to the comprehension of the role virtual influencers play in modern marketing tactics. The results from this research imply that virtual influencers can act as influential celebrity endorsers, given that specific conditions are fulfilled. One key aspect highlighted in the study is the significance of perceived authenticity in determining the success of virtual influencers. This insight leads to the recommendation that marketing professionals should aim to design virtual influencers that resonate as genuine and connectable to the intended audience. The research concluded that the success of virtual influencers in the role of celebrity endorsers depends on various elements, such as the virtual influencer's perceived authenticity, the alignment between the virtual influencer and the product being endorsed, and the receptiveness of the target audience towards virtual influencers.

Cheung and Leung, (2021) research, titled "Virtual Influencers as Celebrity Endorsers," utilized an online survey to explore customer attitudes toward virtual celebrities and their efficacy in advertising. This investigation juxtaposed a human-like virtual star, Lil Miquela, with a cartoon figure, Hatsune Miku. The results showed a preference among respondents for the cartoon character Hatsune Miku, who was seen as more appealing and

trustworthy than Lil Miquela. In contrast, opinions on the expertise of both virtual celebrities were evenly divided. These findings offer essential insights into how virtual influencers function in online advertising. The data indicates that the virtual influencer's appearance, whether resembling a human or a cartoon, can substantially impact how they are perceived regarding attractiveness and credibility. The neutrality observed in the study implies that the nature of virtual influencers may not be a significant determinant in their success as brand endorsers, suggesting an avenue for additional investigation. The researchers posited that the future for human-like virtual celebrities appears promising, though it may present challenges for advertisers aiming to incorporate virtual influencers into marketing efforts. The study acknowledges its limitations and calls for further exploration in this field.

The review found that human endorsers also significantly draw visual attention in advertising campaign settings. When recognizable personalities endorse a product, the brand becomes more memorable, and consumers are likelier to engage with it (Firman et al., 2021). Compared with AI endorsers, human endorsers bring authenticity and personal connection that resonates with many consumers. Their unique charisma and reputation can help build trust and influence consumer behavior, drawing visual attention and promoting user interaction (Zhou et al., 2020). On the other hand, human endorsers leverage personal connection, authenticity, and trust, factors AI has yet to replicate fully. The power of human endorsers lies in their ability to connect emotionally with consumers, influence perceptions, and improve the memorability of brands (Singh et al., 2021; Nadube & Gowon, 2020). This suggests a different but complementary approach to AI for attracting consumer attention. As with AI, the effectiveness of human endorsers can vary, underscoring the need for continuous research and development of endorsement strategies.

The effectiveness of AI and human endorsers in advertising campaigns, when directly compared, reveals distinct advantages for each. The personalized approach of AI, coupled with the genuine nature of human endorsers, plays a significant role in shaping consumer behavior and visual attention. The decision to utilize AI or human endorsers should be strategic, considering factors such as the intended audience, product type, and specific marketing goals (Franke et al., 2023). Rather than pitting AI against human influence, the literature encourages viewing them as complementary components within a more extensive marketing framework (Li et al., 2023) By understanding the context, audience, and objectives, marketers can craft

campaigns that harmoniously integrate AI and human endorsers to achieve the desired outcomes. Future studies may shed light on the most effective ways to combine AI and human endorsers and how their influence might differ across various demographic segments and product classifications. The interplay between AI and human endorsers in advertising campaigns represents a fertile ground for continued exploration, with the potential to uncover vital insights that could shape future digital marketing strategies and consumer behavior.

CONCLUSION

Verma et al., (2021) initially conceptualized AI and its potential applications in various sectors, including marketing. They highlighted the transformative power of AI in creating personalized and dynamic ads using advanced machine learning techniques. Further research by (Chen et al., 2022) delved into the pivotal change AI has brought to video advertising. They underscored the importance of AI-generated endorsers in retaining consumer attention, marking a significant evolution from the traditional 'endorser' role in advertising campaigns. Despite the extensive research on human endorsers, (Lavdas et al., 2021) identified a research gap concerning the effect of AI endorsers on visual attention. Their findings suggested that AI endorsers could boost ad strategies and enhance the theoretical understanding of consumer behavior. (Campbell et al., 2020) further emphasized the potential of AI endorsers in offering marketers critical insights for better campaigns.

REFERENCES

- Albarq, A. N., Kumar, S., Piaralal, A. / L., Awais Bhatti, M., Zainal, A., Bin, A., & Razak, A. (2022). Impact Of Internet Celebrity Endorsements And Social Media Influencers On The Creation Of Brand Image And Sales Through Social Media.
- Armando, M., Ochs, M., & Régner, I. (2022). The Impact of Pedagogical Agents' Gender on Academic Learning: A Systematic Review. *Frontiers in Artificial Intelligence*, 5. <https://doi.org/10.3389/frai.2022.862997>
- Campbell, C., Sands, S., Ferraro, C., Tsao, H.-Y. (Jody), & Mavrommatis, A. (2020). From data to action: How marketers can leverage AI. *Business Horizons*, 63(2), 227–243. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bushor.2019.12.002>

- Carrion, C., Wang, Z., Nair, H., Luo, X., Lei, Y., Gu, P., Lin, X., Chen, W., Jin, J., Zhu, F., Peng, C., Bao, Y., Lin, Z., Yan, W., & Shao, J. (2023). Blending Advertising with Organic Content in E-commerce via Virtual Bids. *Proceedings of the AAAI Conference on Artificial Intelligence*, 37(13), 15476–15484. <https://doi.org/10.1609/aaai.v37i13.26835>
- Chen, J., Or, C. K., & Chen, T. (2022). Effectiveness of Using Virtual Reality–Supported Exercise Therapy for Upper Extremity Motor Rehabilitation in Patients With Stroke: Systematic Review and Meta-analysis of Randomized Controlled Trials. *Journal of Medical Internet Research*, 24(6), e24111. <https://doi.org/10.2196/24111>
- Cheung, F., & Leung, W.-F. (2021). Virtual Influencers As Celebrity Endorsers. In *International Journal of Management and Applied Science* (Issue 7). <http://iraj.in>
- Firman, A., Ilyas, G. B., Reza, H. K., Lestari, S. D., & Putra, A. H. P. K. (2021). The Mediating Role of Customer Trust on the Relationships of Celebrity Endorsement and E-WOM to Instagram Purchase Intention. *Jurnal Minds: Manajemen Ide Dan Inspirasi*, 8(1), 107. <https://doi.org/10.24252/minds.v8i1.20594>
- Franke, C., Groeppel-Klein, A., & Müller, K. (2023). Consumers’ Responses to Virtual Influencers as Advertising Endorsers: Novel and Effective or Uncanny and Deceiving? *Journal of Advertising*, 52(4), 523–539. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00913367.2022.2154721>
- Greenberg, D. M., Matz, S. C., Schwartz, H. A., & Fricke, K. R. (2021). The self-congruity effect of music. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 121(1), 137–150. <https://doi.org/10.1037/pspp0000293>
- Haleem, A., Javaid, M., Asim Qadri, M., Pratap Singh, R., & Suman, R. (2022). Artificial intelligence (AI) applications for marketing: A literature-based study. *International Journal of Intelligent Networks*, 3, 119–132. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijin.2022.08.005>
- Hye, E. (2023). Content Marketing Strategy for Affiliate Marketing E-Commerce Company in the Dutch market. Case: Bonusway OyThesis Title Content Marketing Strategy for Driving Growth in Affiliate Marketing E-commerce in the Dutch market Number of pages and appendix pages 38 + 1.
- Lavdas, A., Salingaros, N., & Sussman, A. (2021). Visual Attention Software: A New Tool for Understanding the “Subliminal” Experience of the Built Environment. *Applied Sciences*, 11(13), 6197. <https://doi.org/10.3390/app11136197>
- Li, J., Huang, J., & Li, Y. (2023). Examining the effects of authenticity fit and association fit: A digital human avatar endorsement model. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 71, 103230. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jretconser.2022.103230>

- Lou, C., Kang, H., & Tse, C. H. (2022). Bots vs. humans: how schema congruity, contingency-based interactivity, and sympathy influence consumer perceptions and patronage intentions. *International Journal of Advertising*, 41(4), 655–684. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02650487.2021.1951510>
- Mishra, S., & Tyagi, A. K. (2022). The Role of Machine Learning Techniques in Internet of Things-Based Cloud Applications (pp. 105–135). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-87059-1_4
- Nadube, P. M., & Gowon, E. (2020). Celebrity Endorsement And Sales Performance Of Telecommunication Firms In Port-Harcourt. In *International Journal of Innovations in Strategic Management and Marketing* (Vol. 8, Issue 1).
- Nguyen, L. (2023). Artificial Intelligence in E-commerce Progressive AI application as a solution to improve customer experience in the E-commerce industry.
- Nwachukwu, D., & Affen, M. (2023). Artificial Intelligence Marketing Practices: The Way Forward to Better Customer Experience Management in Africa (Systematic Literature Review). <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/369370172>
- Owusu Asante, I., Jiang, Y., Md Hossin, A., & Luo, X. (2023). Optimization Of Consumer Engagement With Artificial Intelligence Elements On Electronic Commerce Platforms. In *Journal of Electronic Commerce Research* (Vol. 24).
- Pelau, C., Nistoreanu, P., Lazar, L., & Badescu, R. (2022). Celebrity vs. Product: A Neuroscientific Approach to the Distractors in Food Advertising for Sustainable Marketing. *Sustainability*, 14(19), 12768. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su141912768>
- Rathore, B. (2023). Integration of Artificial Intelligence & It's Practices in Apparel Industry. In *International Journal of New Media Studies (IJNMS)*: Vol. ISSN.
- Sarath Kumar Boddu, R., Santoki, A. A., Khurana, S., Vitthal Koli, P., Rai, R., & Agrawal, A. (2022). An analysis to understand the role of machine learning, robotics and artificial intelligence in digital marketing. *Materials Today: Proceedings*, 56, 2288–2292. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.matpr.2021.11.637>
- Singh, R. K., Kushwaha, B. P., Chadha, T., & Singh, V. A. (2021). Influence Of Digital Media Marketing And Celebrity Endorsement On Consumer Purchase Intention. *Journal of Content, Community and Communication*, 14(7), 145–158. <https://doi.org/10.31620/JCCC.12.21/12>
- Thomas, V. L., & Fowler, K. (2021). Close Encounters of the AI Kind: Use of AI Influencers As Brand Endorsers. *Journal of Advertising*, 50(1), 11–25. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00913367.2020.1810595>

AGREGAT: Jurnal Ekonomi dan Bisnis
Volume 7 (No 2), 2023
<http://journal.uhamka.ac.id/index.php/agregat/>
p-ISSN: 2549-5658 e-ISSN: 2549-7243
DOI: 10.22236/agregat_vol7.i2/12491
Pp 143-152

- Verma, S., Sharma, R., Deb, S., & Maitra, D. (2021). Artificial intelligence in marketing: Systematic review and future research direction. *International Journal of Information Management Data Insights*, 1(1), 100002. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jjime.2020.100002>
- Yin, J., & Qiu, X. (2021). AI Technology and Online Purchase Intention: Structural Equation Model Based on Perceived Value. *Sustainability*, 13(10), 5671. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su13105671>
- Zhou, F., Mou, J., Su, Q., & Jim Wu, Y. C. (2020). How does consumers' Perception of Sports Stars' Personal Brand Promote Consumers' brand love? A mediation model of global brand equity. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 54, 102012. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jretconser.2019.102012>